Supplementary Notes 3

Promoting assessment *for* and *as* learning at the senior secondary level: Focusing on the development of writing skills

[Supplementary notes to Chapter 4.3.7 Assessment for Learning and Chapter 5.2 Formative and Summative Assessment in the English Language Curriculum and Assessment Guide (Secondary 4-6)(CDC & HKEAA, 2007), p.98 & pp.110-111]

Part A: Assessment for Learning in Action

While assessment for learning is practised during the daily learning and teaching process and involves close attention to small "chunks" of learning, a task given by the end of a learning unit/module/cycle can also provide opportunities for learners to demonstrate what they have learnt in the unit/module/cycle and for teachers to collect useful data to inform learning and teaching, which serves to promote assessment for learning.

The following example features how a writing task* can serve as an assessment task after learners have completed a unit on the theme "Teenage Life", which lasts for about twelve 40-minute lessons and covers the following learning activities:

- Reading newspaper articles and reports on teenage problems (e.g. materialism, teenage suicide)
- Reading an editorial on "Kong Kid Phenomenon" and a one-sided argumentative essay on protective parents
- Watching a short video clip on the problem of compensated dating
- Listening to an audio clip on a discussion about the stress of teenagers among experts
- Conducting a group discussion on the strengths and weaknesses of teenagers in Hong Kong
- Learning vocabulary related to teen problems and adjectives to describe Hong Kong teenagers

This writing assessment task is designed to provide opportunities for learners to demonstrate their ability to express and justify views on teenage issues, as well as their mastery of topical vocabulary and text-type features of a one-sided argumentative essay. This writing task, adopting a process-writing approach, provides opportunities for teachers to conduct assessment for learning through collecting information about learners' progress in different stages. Suggestions on how to provide constructive feedback to learners are provided. Activities involving learners' self-assessment and self-reflection are also included to promote assessment as learning.

The example contains the following parts:

Section A includes the topic and features of the writing task, e.g. the level pitched at, the text-type, the communicative functions, the role of the writer and the target readers.

Section B provides an analysis of the task requirements in terms of the content, language and organisation.

Section C presents the suggested teaching procedures for a process writing approach and provides guidelines on incorporating assessment for learning to address learners' learning needs.

Section D provides a set of assessment forms to be adopted for self, peer and teacher assessments.

Section E includes a sample student work with teachers' feedback, which highlights some strategies for and approaches to giving constructive feedback.

Section F presents some teaching suggestions for stretching students who can manage the basic task requirements.

^{*} Tasks which require learners to demonstrate other language skills (i.e. speaking, reading, and listening) or integrated skills can also be designed at the end of a learning unit/module/cycle as assessment tasks.

Section A

Assessment Task

Topic:	Some experts in education have observed that Hong Kong teenagers are too pampered and spoilt by their parents, resulting in their lack of self-management and problem-solving skills. One proposed solution to this problem is requiring senior secondary students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before they are allowed to graduate from secondary school. Write an article to the school newspaper to express whether you agree with this proposal and give at least three reasons to support your view. Write about 300 – 400 words.
Related Module / Elective Module:	 Study, School Life and Work Learning English through Social Issues Learning English through Debating
Student Level:	Senior Secondary (S4-6)
Text-type:	School magazine article
Communicative Functions:	 Express agreement and disagreement Justify one's point of view
Role of the Writer:	A senior secondary student
Target Reader:	Secondary students and teachers

Section B

Task requirements - a detailed analysis of the question

Language

Vocabulary

 Vocabulary related to voluntary work and community services (e.g. independence, interpersonal skills, care for others)

Tone and Register

- A persuasive tone
- A semi-formal tone

Language Items & Structures

- Persuasive devices (e.g. rhetorical sentences, emphatic structures, modal verbs)
- Sentence structures for giving reasons and showing cause-and-effect relationship
- Sentence structures for citing sources and providing evidence
- Sentence structures for addressing opposing views

Content

Relevant ideas and elaboration

Stating the stance towards the proposal, justifying the stance with three reasons for/against requiring 50 hours of community service before graduating from secondary schools

Providing relevant supporting details (e.g. statistics, examples) and clear explanation for each argument

Some experts in education have observed that Hong Kong teenagers are too pampered and spoilt by their parents, resulting in their lack of self-management and problem-solving skills. One proposed solution to this problem is requiring senior secondary students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before they are allowed to graduate from their secondary schools. Write an article to the school newspaper to express whether you agree with this proposal and give at least three reasons to support your view.

Additional ideas

Constructing arguments with considerations for different stakeholders' perspectives (e.g. schools, teachers, students)

Providing background

information about the

issue (e.g. problems of

teenagers nowadays)

Addressing some of the arguments likely to be brought up by people with the opposing view

Suggesting better alternatives to the proposed measure if disagreeing with the proposal

Organisation

Coherence

 Clear organisation framework for a one-sided argumentative essay (i.e. an introduction, 3-4 body paragraphs and a conclusion)

Cohesion

- Appropriate use of cohesive devices to link up key arguments
- Logical connection within and across paragraphs

Section C

Teaching procedures for the pre- and post-writing stages

	Tea	nching steps	Remarks
	1. • •	Ask students to form groups of four and collect articles or video clips about "community service", "voluntary work" and "service learning" before lessons. They should research for information that helps to answer the following questions: What is "service learning"? Is there any difference between "community service" and "voluntary work"? What are the arguments for and against introducing community service into the curriculum in secondary schools?	Remarks
	2.	Ask students to report what they have found in response to the questions. Organise students' ideas and introduce vocabulary related to the topic.	
2 lessons	3.	Revisit a one-sided argumentative text covered in the unit (See Appendix 1) and draw students' attention to the structure and salient features of a one-sided argumentative essay (e.g. introduction, body paragraphs and conclusion).	For more advanced students who have no difficulty understanding the structure of a one-sided argumentative essay and fulfilling the basic task requirements,
	4.	Introduce the writing task. Elicit students' understanding of the task requirements, including the issue, the writing purpose, the writer-reader relationship, the tone, the content and the overall structure. Brainstorm ideas on the background information of the issue and reasons for/against the proposals.	teachers might like to adopt some of the teaching suggestions in Section F , to help students produce writing with more sophisticated ideas and writing style.
	5.	Give out the Teacher Assessment Form in Section D and go through the criteria with students. Establish a set of assessment criteria with students by selecting items/section(s) to focus on for the first draft of their writing	The 20 assessment criteria suggested in the Teacher Assessment Form are neither prescriptive nor exhaustive. Depending on students' ability levels and learning needs, as well as the areas the teacher would

			like to focus on, the teacher may
			adjust the number of sections
			and items to be introduced to the
			students and covered in each
			draft. For example, the teacher
			may focus only on the criteria
			under the "Content" and
			"Organisation" sections for the
			first draft and deal with criteria
			under "Language" in the second
			draft. Alternatively, the teacher
			may select ten core items from
			the three sections to focus on for
			the first draft and extend to cover
			all criteria for the second draft.
	6.	Ask students to write the first draft of the article	
		individually.	
1	7.	Provide feedback on the students' first draft by filling in	
1 lesson		the Teacher Assessment Form. Return the completed	
_ š		Teacher Assessment Form to students and discuss the	
		general performance of students in class. Provide	
		suggestions for improvement with reference to	
		samples from students' writing.	
	8.	Ask students to re-read their own work and review it	
		with reference to the Teacher Assessment Form. They	
		then complete the "Students' Reflections" section.	
	9.	Give out the Self/Peer Assessment Form in Section D .	While 20 items are provided in
		Establish a set of assessment criteria for assessing the	the Self/Peer Assessment Form,
		second draft by selecting the sessions/ items to focus	teachers could flexibly adjust the
		on and discussing the relevant criteria with students.	number of items to be included
	10.	Ask students to write the second draft of the article	and simplify the language where
		individually.	necessary to make the self/peer
	11.	Ask students to review their own/their peers' second	assessment task manageable to
		draft with reference to the assessment criteria in the	students. 8-10 items are generally
		Self/Peer Assessment Form. They then make revisions	considered manageable for
		to their own work and submit the second draft,	average senior secondary
		together with (i) the first draft, (ii) the Teacher	students.
		Feedback Form on the first draft with the "Students'	

		Reflections" section completed, and (iii) the completed self/peer assessment form, to the teacher.	
1 lesson	12.	Read students' writing, identify the strengths and problematic areas and provide written feedback. Display samples of student writing to the whole class and design relevant follow-up activities to help students improve their work.	Refer to Section E for suggestions on how to provide quality feedback.
	13.	Students revise their second draft based on comments from the teacher and what they have learned from the follow-up activities in class. They submit the final work together with the first and second drafts as well as the assessment forms.	
1 lesson	14.	Read through students' final work and assess their writing with reference to the assessment criteria. Provide feedback and further support for students.	

Appendix 1

Sample Argumentative Essay

Are Hong Kong Parents Over-protective?

<u>Introduction</u>

When some Hong Kong students were stranded in London Heathrow Airport because of a snowstorm last December, we were all stunned by their selfish behaviour and poor self-management skills. Little did they do except whining about the flight cancellation and poor arrangements of the airlines. They even made up stories of their parents' death in order to board the first flight home. It is obvious that these Hong Kong children are spoilt. Yet, who is to blame for their "prince / princess syndrome"? You will know the answer when you see their doting parents, who joined in the complaints and urged the SAR government to charter flights to bring the kids home. Such over-reaction is typical of Hong Kong parents, who are, in my opinion, mostly over-protective.

Central Argument

Body

Topic Sentence

Many Hong Kong parents take care of every detail in their children's life. They rush to their rescue when their children face any difficulties. Madeleine Levine, an American clinical psychologist, coined the term "helicopter parents" to describe parents who hover over their children, even when they are already adults. These parents dote on their children so much that they do everything for them. In some extreme cases, I have seen parents accompany their children to universities and help them tidy up their dorm rooms. While these parents may argue that they just want to express their concern for their children, what they do not realise is that their excessive care may hamper their children's development of problem-solving skills.

Supporting details - Expert opinion

Supporting details - Cases/examples

Opposing viewpoint & refutation

Topic Sentence

Hong Kong parents are also over-involved in their children's school work. They dedicate much of their energy and time to preparing their children for tests and examinations. Some even help their children to finish projects and assignments. A study conducted by the Society for Child Development indicates that over half of the parents interviewed have experienced anxiety over their children's school work, and 75% of them are willing to offer any kind of

Supporting details Statistics

school work. Vicky Tuck, the principal of Cheltenham Ladies'
College, warns parents that their over-conscientiousness and
constant supervision may prevent their children from growing
into responsible and independent learners.

Supporting details - Expert's opinion

Hong Kong parents are over-tolerant of their ← children's misbehaviour. As most families in Hong Kong nowadays have few children, parents tend to lavish the kids with care and money but forget the importance of disciplining them. It is common to see children running around or shouting on ← public transports while their parents do nothing to stop them. As the old saying goes, "spare the rod and spoil the child." Parents' unreasonable forbearance leads to children's lack of respect for authority. This explains why discipline problems are on the rise in Hong Kong schools.

Topic Sentence

Supporting details - Cases/ examples

Conclusion

Clearly, it is the over-protective Hong Kong parents who create the over-pampered "Hong Kong kids". To fix the problem, parents must change their mindset. They should bear in mind that their children will have to grow out of their protective cocoon and stand on their own feet one day. Over-protection only encourages unhealthy reliance, which definitely does more harm than good to the children's personal development. Children need guidance, not indulgence. It is time that Hong Kong parents reflected on their mode of parenting.

Reiteration of stance

Here are some sentence structures used to add strengths to the arguments and enhance persuasiveness

	Examples
Inversion	• <u>Little did</u> they <u>do</u> except whining about the flight cancellation and poor arrangements of the airlines.
Rhetorical questions	Yet, who is to blame for their "prince / princess syndrome"?
Cause-and-effect structures	 These parents dote on their children so much that they do everything for them. As most families in Hong Kong nowadays have few children, parents tend to lavish the kids with care and money. Parents' unreasonable forbearance leads to children's lack of respect for authority.
Emphatic structures	 Clearly, <u>it is</u> the over-protective Hong Kong parents <u>who</u> create the over-pampered "Hong Kong kids". Children need guidance, <u>not</u> indulgence. <u>It is time that</u> Hong Kong parents <u>reflected</u> on their mode of parenting.

Section D

Teacher Assessment Form

Date:	
Daic.	

Task:

Writing an article to the school newspaper arguing either for or against the proposal which requires students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before students are allowed to graduate from secondary school.

Text Type: A school newspaper article (one-sided argumentative article)

	Please tick: ✓	Unsatis-	Below	Average	Good	Excellent
		factory	Average			
A.	Content					
1.	Providing background information about the issue					
2.	Stating one's stance clearly					
3.	Presenting at least three valid reasons to support one's stance					
4.	Supporting the reasons with appropriate details, (e.g. by					
	introducing expert opinion, statistics and cases or examples)					
5.	Including arguments from different perspectives					
6.	Addressing the opposing arguments and refuting them to					
	strengthen one's arguments					
7.	Writing about 300 to 400 words					
В.	Language and Style					
1.	Adopting a semi-formal and persuasive tone to present one's					
	views and arguments to the intended audience					
2.	Using suitable vocabulary related to the background of the issue,					
	the proposal on compulsory community service					
3.	Using appropriate expressions and sentence structures to present					
	different kinds of evidence (e.g. statistics, expert opinions)					
4.	Use appropriate expressions and structures to give reasons and					
	show cause and effect relationship					
5.	Using appropriate expressions and sentence structures to address					
	opposing views					
6.	Using the simple present tense to present general facts					
7.	Using rhetorical strategies to catch the reader's attention (e.g.					
	rhetorical questions, imperatives, conditional sentences,					
	inversions and other emphatic structures)					
8.	Using punctuation correctly and appropriately					
9.	Spelling words correctly					
C.	Organisation					
1.	Five to six paragraphs, each with a clear focus					
2.	Using an organisational framework (i.e. an opening section to					
	present the background information about the issue and one's					
	stance, a body to support one's view with at least three					
	arguments/reasons, and a conclusion to summarise one's					
	arguments and reiterate one's stance)					
3.	Using topic sentences effectively and providing relevant details to					
	create logical development of ideas in a paragraph					
4.	Using appropriate cohesive devices to establish connection					
	between key arguments and paragraphs					

<u> </u>	Teachers' Comments	
D.	reachers Comments	
	Students' Reflections	
•		edback and comments, I have identified some areas for further
	_	
	improvement and planned the follow-up ac	SHOUS.
	Weaknesses / areas of improvement	Actions to be taken
	e.g. I haven't got enough	e.g. I will search the Internet for statistical
	supporting details for my key	data showing Hong Kong students' poor
	arguments.	self-management and problem-solving skills
	ta gianterus.	
		and check if any experts in this field (such as
		social workers and psychologists) have made
		any comments on this.
	I need to seek advice/assistance from my	teacher on the following areas:
	ŕ	•

Peer /Self Assessment Form

Date:	

Task: Writing an article to the school newspaper arguing either for or against the proposal which requires students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised

by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before students are allowed to graduate from

secondary school.

Text Type: A school newspaper article (one-sided argumentative article)

	Please tick: ✓	Needs Improvement	Satisfactory	Well Done
Α.	Content	Improvement		Done
1.	Providing background information about the issue (e.g. showing cases of			
٠.	Hong Kong students' lack of self-management and problem-solving skills)		_	
2.	Stating one's stance clearly (i.e. either agreeing or disagreeing with the			
	proposal)			
3.	Suggesting at least three valid reasons to support one's stance			
4.	Supporting the reasons with appropriate details, (e.g. by introducing expert			
	opinion, statistics and cases or examples)		_	
5.	Including arguments from different perspectives (e.g. from the angles of the			
	students, parents, teachers, schools and society)			
6.	Addressing the opposing arguments and refuting them to strengthen one's			
	arguments			
7.	Writing about 300 to 400 words			
B.	Language and Style			
1.	Adopting a semi-formal and persuasive tone to present one's views and			
	arguments to the intended audience			
2.	Using suitable vocabulary related to the background of the issue, the proposal			
	on compulsory community service (e.g. independence, interpersonal skills,			
	care for others)			
3.				
	, ,			
4.	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •			
_	,	_	_	_
5.	•		Ш	
•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
7.	•		Ш	
	·			
0				
			Ш	
	•	_	_	_
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
2.			Ш	Ш
2				
ა.				
1				
4.				
3.	on compulsory community service (e.g. independence, interpersonal skills, care for others) Using appropriate expressions and sentence structure (e.g. According to (sb/sthg),; As said by (sb),; A survey/research conducted by showed that") to present different kinds of evidence (e.g. statistics, expert opinions) Using appropriate expressions and structures to give reasons (e.g. I agree that because) and show cause and effect relationship (e.g will bring about/lead to) Using appropriate expressions and sentence structures to address opposing views (e.g. Some people may argue that, but) Using the simple present tense to present general facts Using rhetorical strategies to catch the reader's attention (e.g. rhetorical questions, imperatives, conditional sentences, inversions and other emphatic structures) Using punctuation correctly and appropriately Spelling words correctly Organisation			

D.	Other Comments

14 Section E

Sample Script with Teacher's Feedback

Topic: Some experts in education have observed that Hong Kong teenagers are too pampered and spoilt by their parents, resulting in their lack of self-management and problem-solving skills. One proposed solution to this problem is requiring students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before they are allowed to graduate from secondary school. Write an article to the school newspaper to express whether you agree with this proposal and give at least three reasons for your view.

Student's Work:

Many people comment that students in Hong Kong are only good at studying and have no life skills. Some experts have found that students in Hong Kong are poor at self-management and problem-solving skills because of the over-protection by their parents. Children are provided all they want, no matter whether it is necessary. Under this situation, some people have proposed that students should be required to undertake 50 hours of community service before they are allowed to graduate from secondary school. Can this proposal improve the current

In my opinion, the proposal is not a good solution to the problem.

Your opening contains too much directly copied information from the question. Could you come up with a more creative opening to show the importance of the issue? You may use dialogue, findings or some vivid descriptions to build the scenario.

Consider stating your position in the first paragraph.

Effective use of a rhetorical question

situation?

True! I agree that forcing students to do voluntary work defeats the

First, as Hong Kong students have little experience in social service, they may not know how to do it. If they just do it because they want to meet the requirement but without the heart of learning from this, they will not change much after the 50 hours of work. Their self-management and problem solving skills will still be the same. People may argue that this is still better than nothing and students may gain some experience from the_ process, but I think there are more effective ways to develop students' skills than this. If the government insist on implementing this policy, the whole spirit of voluntary work will do not participate in the service willingly be gone as students are not willing to do it with the aim to serve others. Students cannot benefit from the social service and their time will be wasted.

This may not be relevant to the main idea expressed in the rest of the paragraph.

Could you rephrase this to express the idea more -idiomatically? Consider words like "mindset" "intention".

Could you give an example of one of the effective ways?

Nice recap of the key argument

purpose.

Thoughtful of you to take possible arguments into account and try

counter-

to address them

Nowadays, students in Hong Kong have to join a lot of extra-curricular activities such as music instrument classes, swimming courses and sports teams. These activities already occupy most of their free time. Students already feel that time is insufficient for coping with extra-curricular activities and their homeworks. If we take 50 hours more from their free time, which is supposed to be for entertainment and rest, students would be so tired and overloaded. Though we can ask students to do the voluntary work after their public examination at the end of S6, students should actually enjoy some fun and relax after a long long time of hard work. Force them to do social service exploit their rest and play time.

You need a better topic sentence to show -the focus of this paragraph

Chinglish. Try to rewrite using "... deprives (sb) of (sthg)"

Moreover, self-management and problem solving skills will beacquired gradually as students grow up. When students enter society or job market, they have to deal with people and problems and think of solutions. It is not necessary for the government to take such strong action to fix the problem or push students to develop. When students graduate from secondary school and start working, they need to finish their duties and face the difficulties by theirself. They cannot depend on their teachers and parents anymore. This problem of poor self-management will not exist anymore.

Would it be too late to wait till students enter the job market to develop such basic skills? Can they develop them earlier at school or home?

You seem to be repeating what's already said. Add an example or quote from an expert to support your view.

The argument that the problem will cease to exist as students get a job may be too simplistic and weak.

A very concise wrap-up showing your line of argument clearly Effective use of the parallel structure!

In conclusion, the policy is ineffective, time-consuming and unnecessary. 50 hours of community service before graduating from secondary school should not be implemented.

Teacher Assessment Form

Date:	
Task:	

Writing an article to the school newspaper arguing either for or against the proposal which requires students to undertake 50 hours of community service, in addition to the community services organised by the schools for the Other Learning Experiences (OLE), before students, are allowed to graduate from secondary school.

Text Type:

A school newspaper article (one-sided argumentative article)

	Please tick: ✓	Unsatis-	Below	Average	Good	Excellent
		factory	Average			
A.	Content					
1.	Providing background information about the issue					
2.	Stating one's stance clearly				\square	
3.	Presenting at least three valid reasons to support one's stance			\square		
4.	Supporting the reasons with appropriate details, (e.g. by		☑			
	introducing expert opinion, statistics and cases or examples)					
5.	Including arguments from different perspectives		\square			
6.	Addressing the opposing arguments and critique them to				\square	
	strengthen ones' argument					
7.	Writing about 300 to 400 words				\square	
B.	Language and Style					
1.	Adopting a semi-formal and persuasive tone to present one's views and arguments to the intended audience				\square	
2.	Using suitable vocabulary related to the background of the issue,					
	the proposal on compulsory community service					
3.	Using appropriate expressions and sentence structures to present		\square			
	different kinds of evidence (e.g. statistics, expert opinions)					
4.	Use appropriate expressions and structures to give reasons and			\square		
	show cause and effect relationship					
5.	Using appropriate expressions and sentence structures to address					
	opposing views					
6.	Using the simple present tense to present general facts					
7.	Using rhetorical strategies to catch the reader's attention (e.g.			\square		
	rhetorical questions, imperatives, conditional sentences, inversions					
	and other emphatic structures)					
8.	Using punctuation correctly and appropriately					
9.	Spelling words correctly				\square	
C.	Organisation					
1.	Five to six paragraphs, each with a clear focus					
2.	Using an organisational framework (i.e. an opening section to					
	present the background information about the issue and one's					
	stance, a body to support one's view with at least three					
	arguments/reasons, and a conclusion to summarise one's					
	arguments and reiterate one's stance)					
3.	Using topic sentences effectively and providing relevant details to		\square			
	create logical development of ideas in a paragraph					
4.	Using appropriate cohesive devices to establish connection			\square		
	between key arguments and paragraphs					1

D. Teachers' Comments

Chris,

You have presented your view clearly and made a good attempt to support your stance with three reasons.

Your third reason may not be solid enough. I suggest you strengthen it with more supporting details (e.g. examples, statistical data, a quotation from an expert) or replace it with a more convincing reason.

While thinking about stronger points to replace your third reason, try to approach the issue from a wider perspective. You have been focussing mainly on students so far, but the impacts of the proposal on other parties (e.g. schools/teachers, parents, the Government, or the community/society) are also worth considering.

Read through my comments in the margin and try to address them in your revision. Let me know if you need more advice. Keep up with the good efforts.

E. Students' Reflections

Taking into consideration the teacher's feedback and comments, I have identified some areas for further improvement and planned the follow-up actions:

Weaknesses / areas of improvement	Actions to be taken
e.g. I haven't got enough	e.g. I will search the Internet for statistical
supporting details for my key	data showing Hong Kong students' poor
arguments.	self-management and problem-solving skills
	and check if any experts in this field (such as
	social workers and psychologists) have made
	any comments on this.

I need to seek advice/assistance from	n my teacher on the following areas	•	

How to Provide Feedback or Comment on Learners' Writing

Effective feedback

- closes the gap between present performance and desired standards
- gives learners information to understand where they are in their learning and what to do next
- aligns with the assessment criteria and learning objectives/goals
- builds learner confidence and increases motivation, engagement and interest
- helps to promote self-reflection and management and equips learners with metacognitive skills (e.g. self-evaluation and self-monitoring, directing and regulating of follow-up actions for improvement) essential for implementing assessment as learning

As shown in the sample script, teachers can give feedback in different ways to promote student learning, reflection and improvement. Considerations should be given to the following when deciding the kinds of feedback to be provided for a particular assessment task:

- learning and assessment objectives
- focus and purpose of the tasks
- learners' ability levels and preferences

Common ways: indicating errors through

- the amount of time available
- the communication style preferred

The table below shows different approaches to giving feedback and their key features:

Selective/focused Comprehensive/detailed Focusing mainly on high-order/macro- Focusing on every aspect of the writing, including grammatical and mechanical level issues or key objectives of the assessment task aspects of the writing • Identifying the most important issues Correcting each individual error learners should focus on for • Excessive markups may be visually overwhelming and not conducive to improvement helping learners develop self-correction skills and identify priorities for improvement Indirect feedback Direct feedback Prompting learners to realise their Correcting learners' errors by giving explicit problems and come up with solutions by written corrections or rewriting the offering cues, guidance and problematic part for them opportunities for self-correction More useful for less advanced learners who may be unable to identify and correct

- underlining, circling and using codes or posing referential and open questions in the margins to provoke thoughts
- Useful in encouraging learners to reflect on aspects of their writing and formulate strategies for improvement
- errors even indicated with codes for them
- Appropriate in situations when errors that cannot be easily fixed through self-correction, such as the choice of words and sentence patterns, or when teachers want to point out error patterns that require learners' attention and demonstrate effective revision strategies

Comments in the margins

- Providing an immediate and proximate index of strengths and weaknesses
- Offering timely praise, criticism, and questions on a particular part of the writing
- Providing concrete evidence to support the final / overall comments

Final / overall comments

- Providing a big picture and a more general overview of the strengths and weaknesses of the work
- Making references to the specific examples and points raised in the marginal comments
- Prioritising points for revision and future improvement

Formative comments

- Intended to help learners revise their drafts
- More developmental (focusing on growth rather than grading)
- Focusing on directions and recommendations for revision
- Appropriate for process writing

Summative comments

- Evaluating the quality of a final product
- Focusing on describing the strengths and the weaknesses of the work and explaining the final result awarded in connection to the performance

Respond as a reader

- Adopting a more personal and less threatening tone
- Relinquishing some of the authority of the assessor
- Using more "I" statements as opposed to "You" statements
- Appropriate for more creative work (e.g. poems, short stories)

Respond as an assessor

- Adopting a more detached and authoritative tone
- More diagnostic and corrective
- Using more "You" or "Your work" statements

Other points to note in providing feedback:

Teachers should:

Before the assessment

 Develop clear assessment criteria (in collaboration with learners if possible) for each task/assignment and communicate the success criteria to learners to ensure that they know how their work will be evaluated

When giving feedback

- Read the entire work before giving feedback to avoid hasty judgement
- Adopt a compassionate and encouraging tone to show learners that you understand what they have attempted to do and appreciate the efforts they have made
- Adopt constructive criticism and use a descriptive tone, instead of an accusatory tone with anger and frustration, when pointing out the problems in learners' performance
- Use mitigated commentary or sandwiching compliments with critique to deliver the negative comments politely without disheartening the learners
- Be specific and avoid vague comments such as "poor grammar", "???", "confusing", "vague"
 "good". Point out specifically what has been done well or poorly and provide crucial
 information for them to improve their writing
- Focus on the important issues instead of trying to cover all aspects of the writing

After learners' receipt of feedback

- Arrange conferencing sessions or small-group tutorials for learners to discuss the feedback received
- Encourage learners to ask questions and seek clarification to establish a dialogue between the assessor and the assessed

Section F

Suggested Activities for More Advanced Students

For students with no difficulty fulfilling the basic task requirements (e.g. writing a five-paragraph essay of 300-400 words, supporting their stance with three relevant arguments), the teacher may like to go beyond the basic level and draw their attention to other more advanced writing skills. Below are some areas that you may work on with your more advanced students.

1. A more effective and engaging introduction

Show students different openings and ask them to discuss the strategies the writers use to make the topic a matter of concern to readers and arouse their interest in reading.

Opening 1

The computer is an indispensable learning tool for students in Hong Kong. Yet, a recent survey revealed that nearly 15% of families in Hong Kong cannot afford to have a computer at home. Students from these underprivileged families really deserve our attention and support. I believe that free computers should be provided to them.

Strategies used:

Opening 2

Melamine in milk, sex hormones in baby formula, Sudan Red in eggs – these are among the most shocking food contamination scandals in China, not to mention the countless unreported cases involving the use of toxic chemicals or unhygienic ingredients in food production. Do we need tighter food safety controls? The answer is an absolute yes.

Strategies used:

Opening 3

Have you heard of King's Glory, Modern Education and Beacon College? I bet most Hong Kong students are familiar with these big names. As I know, every student in my class is taking tutorial classes outside school to prepare for the HKDSE examinations. While school teachers frown upon this practice, parents seem to support and students also consider this a key to success in public examinations. The issue of whether students should attend tutorial schools is one that divides many people and definitely deserves close examination.

Strategies used:

Opening 4

"Hey, shall we discuss the Liberal Studies project in the canteen after school?"

"I cannot make it. I have to rush to the Modern Education Centre for King Chan's tutorial."

Does the conversation sound familiar to you? To many students, lessons don't end when school breaks up at 4 pm because this is the beginning of their after-school tutorial classes. Are students really that keen to learn? Is attending tutorial classes necessary?

Strategies used:

Introduce to students some of the strategies used and encourage them to apply these strategies in their writing:

- > Using rhetorical questions to involve the readers
- > Building a scenario to show the importance of the issue (e.g. using dialogue and vivid descriptions)
- > Citing current news or recent findings to provide background information

2. Strength and quality of arguments

(a) Considering the issue from multiple perspectives

Ask students to list all the parties that the proposal (i.e. 50 hours of community service before graduation from secondary school) will affect and complete the following table:

Stakeholder	How the proposal will affect them?
group	

Ask students to discuss whether each of the parties are likely to support / oppose the proposal and which group(s) views or interest should be considered more when deciding whether to pass the proposal.

Guide students to see the importance of considering an issue from a wider perspective (e.g. parents, schools, society/the community, the Government) and remind them not to limit their three arguments to the impact of the proposal on students.

(b) Adding more substance and supporting details to enhance the arguments

Ask students to read a sample paragraph and identify different kinds of supporting details used:

Central argument:				
The Hong Kong government should not give \$6000 to permanent residents aged 18 or above				
Topic sentences:	Topic sentences:			
The \$6000 cash hand	dout does not help to solve deep-rooted problems			
According to Dr. Y Moneyback of The Everyday Economist, a cash hando				
does little to tackle social problems such as rising property prices and				
wide wealth gap between the rich and the poor.				
	When a cash handout was adopted in Macau last year, people in general			
	spent more money and the inflation rate went up.			
An opinion poll has revealed that 55% of the respondents consider the				
\$6000 handout a short-term fix, while 35% express that they would spend				
the money right away on a phone upgrade or a short vacation.				

Remind students the importance of including the following kinds of supporting details in their body paragraphs:

- Examples / cases
- Statistics
- Expert opinions

3. A more appealing conclusion

Show students different closings and ask them to discuss the strategies the writers use to appeal to the readers.

Closing 1

Central argument: The government should provide free computers for students in needy families.

Computers play a vital role in students' daily life and study. They enable students to finish assignments, provide a rich source of information and are a common means of socialisation. It is therefore clearly evident that every needy family should be provided with a free computer.

Strategies used:

Closing 2

Central argument: The government should tighten food safety controls.

The problem of food contamination should be addressed immediately. The government must take prompt actions and pass new laws to safeguard the health of the public. Only through implementing tighter controls on food safety can we ensure the food we eat is free from toxic substances and disease. I look forward to the day when I need not worry about the safety of the food I eat.

Strategies used:

Closing 3

Central argument: Whether students should attend tutorial schools depends on their motives behind

"We strive for the best" is probably a motto shared by students, teachers, as well as the tutor kings and queens. Both secondary schools and tutorial schools aim at helping students to achieve excellence, though through different means. If students attend tutorial classes with an intention to extend their learning, rather than taking it as a shortcut to success in public exams, tutorial schools may not necessarily be an evil. No matter what, I still hope that students would value learning over exam results and owe their academic achievements not only to King's Glory or Modern Education but also their own schools.

Strategies used:

Introduce to students some of the strategies used to conclude or end an argumentative essay and encourage them to apply these strategies in their writing:

- > recap / summarise the key points made
- suggest solutions and appeal for action
- > express a wish
- > make reference to the opening

Part B: Assessment as Learning in Action

Building on the strengths and benefits of assessment *for* learning, which enhances learning and teaching through the provision of quality feedback and modification in teaching, learners at the senior secondary level can be guided to achieve independence in learning. Towards this end, assessment *as* learning, which serves as an extension and reinforcement of assessment *for* learning, can be introduced.

Assessment *as* learning is more student-centred as compared to assessment *for* learning in the sense that it addresses learners' diverse language abilities, learning needs and interests according to their progress and pace in learning. Assessment *as* learning emphasises the engagement of learners who actively connect assessment to learning. Individual learners are guided to move forward in learning and attain their personalised learning goals. They take on the role as their own critical assessor in the process of learning, reflect on their own work and make judgment about how they can progress in learning.

In assessment *as* learning, learners are provided with opportunities to develop an awareness of their learning progress and performance in the assessment tasks by applying a range of self-reflection and monitoring skills. Self-assessment activities can be used to enable studnets to reflect on their own learning, identify areas of strengths and weaknesses, set their own personal goals and take ownership of their learning.

In the initial stage of incorporating assessment *as* learning into learning and teaching, teachers play an important role in helping learners to develop the capability to think about, plan and improve their own learning. Their directions and support at varying degrees enable learners to acquire and master self-reflective and monitoring skills in a progressive manner to achieve independence in learning. As learners gradually internalise the self-assessment strategies, teachers' support is reduced to allow learners to take full responsibility for improving their own learning.

Assessment as Learning in Action

When learners have successfully exercised self-assessment in assessment for learning during their learning process (for more details, please refer to the students' reflections on their teachers' feedback in Part E of Section D, and the self-assessment form in Section D of the Supplementary Notes 1 on Assessment for Learning), they should be given greater autonomy to make progress in their own learning through assessment as learning, in which learners take charge of their own learning through setting their own learning goals, monitoring and evaluating their own learning.

The following example illustrates how assessment *as* learning could be built on the good practice of assessment *for* learning to improve writing performance. Learners' prior learning experience includes their own understanding of their performance based on the success criteria of a number of recently completed writing assignments and the feedback from teachers.

The example contains the following two sections:

Section A provides four activities and includes the following:

- Aims of the activity
- Students' role in the activity
- Teachers' role in the activity

Section B provides four sets of worksheets for the four learning activities in Section A:

- Worksheet I Appreciation of Good Sample Student Work
- Worksheet II Self-reflection and Goal-setting
- Worksheet III Revision of Learning Goals and Proposed Actions
- Worksheet IV Overall Self-evaluation

Section A

Activity 1: Self-reflection and Goal-setting

This activity aims to engage learners in assessment *as* learning through:

- reflecting on their own strengths and areas for growth in writing;
- reflecting on the comments from their teacher and peers;
- identifying their learning needs;
- setting short-term and long-term goals for improvement; and
- devising actions to attain the learning goals.

An Optional Activity

(Before Activity 1)

If teachers reckon that students need additional practice and support on appreciating good sample writing, they may guide students to appreciate good sample student work by focussing on:

- ideas (e.g. creative/surprising ideas or convincing arguments);
- organsiation (e.g. effective sequencing and linking of ideas);
- language (e.g. good choice of vocabulary and correct grammatical structures of varying degrees of complexity);
- style (e.g. appropriate text forms and use of writing techniques)

Students reflect on the features that constitute a good piece of writing and complete **Worksheet I.**

Refer to Worksheet II

Students study the writing assignments they recently completed and the comments and feedback from their teacher and classmates; choose and compare their least and most satisfactory assignments, reflect on their strengths and weaknesses in writing and identify their learning needs; and

Students	Teachers
formulate short-term and long-term learning goals for improving their writing skills and	 help students distinguish the differences between short-term learning goals which can be achieved within a relatively shorter period of time and easily assessed (e.g. constructing effective topic sentences, using cohesive devices to connect contrastive ideas and improving subject-verb agreement) and long-term learning goals which take a relatively longer period of time to attain and assess (e.g. mastering the features of creative stories, enhancing the persuasiveness in writing and achieving greater coherence in writing); provide a menu of possible goals for students, based on his/her observations of students' weaknesses and discuss with them how to set their own goals;
propose possible actions.	 help students formulate actions by discussing important considerations (e.g. SMART: specific, measurable, achievable or attainable, relevant and time-bound); and provide a menu of possible actions for reference.

Activity 2: Revision of Learning Goals and Proposed Actions

This activity aims to engage students in assessment as learning through:

• revising their learning goals and proposed actions taking into consideration feedback and suggestions from the teacher.

Refer to Worksheet III

Students	Teachers	
 read their teacher's feedback and 	provide feedback and offers suggestions	
suggestions; and	to the students' self-reflection, learning	
	goals and actions proposed; and	
 revise their learning goals and proposed 	discuss with individual students their	
actions.	self-reflection and goals set and provide	
	positive feedback and suggestions on	
	how the learning goals and the proposed	
	actions can be better aligned.	

Activity 3: Self-evaluation during the Learning Process

This activity aims to engage students in assessment as learning through:

- evaluating the attainment of the short-term and long-term learning goals and the effectiveness of the proposed actions for attaining the goals; and
- formulating further actions to improve their writing skills during the learning process.

Refer to Worksheet III

Students	Teachers
evaluate the attainment of their short-term and long-term goals and the effectiveness of the proposed actions in attaining the goals; and	 demonstrate to students the process of self-evaluation and self-reflection through self-questioning; encourage students to reflect on problems they may have encountered and actions they have taken in the learning process through self-questioning; provide positive feedback to individual students on his/her attainment of learning goals and the effectiveness of
	his/her proposed actions; and
formulate further actions to improve their purities skills during the learning.	> advise on means students can further
their writing skills during the learning process	seek help to solve their learning problems and progress in learning.

Activity 4: Overall Self-evaluation

This activity aims to engage students in assessment as learning through:

- evaluating their overall attainment of learning goals and the effectiveness of their proposed actions by the proposed date;
- reflecting on problems encountered and actions taken to overcome them; and
- formulating further actions to improve their writing skills.

Refer to Worksheet IV

Students	Teachers	
 evaluate their overall attainment of learning goals and the effectiveness of their actions; 	provide feedback to individual students on his/her attainment of learning goals and the effectiveness of his/her proposed actions;	
reflect on problems encountered and actions taken to overcome them; and	 advise on means students can further seek help to solve their learning problems and progress towards a higher level of attainment; and 	
plan for the next stage of learning.	provide feedback to the students' self-evaluation and ask them to make suggestions for the next stage of learning.	

Section B

Worksheet 1 (Optional)

Appreciation of Good Sample Student Work

In this activity, I will

- appreciate good sample student work and understand what makes a good piece of writing;
- identify my learning needs; and

 explore next steps for learning to improve my writing st 	KIIIS.
Self-reflection	Sharing from
1. What do I like best? Why?	the teacher and classmates
2. What is the most useful thing I have learnt / the greatest insight I have gained?	
3. What would I like to learn more about?	
4. How would I write differently next time?	

Worksheet II

	Activity 1: Self-reflection and Goal-setting
!n !	study my writing assignments completed in the last months and comments and feedback from my teacher and classmates; compare my most and least satisfactory writing assignments and reflect on my strengths and weaknesses; reflect on how I have made use of the comments from my teacher and classmates; and set my short-term and long-term learning goals and suggest actions for improving my writing skills by (a date).
1.	What have I accomplished in my earlier writing assignments? Which is the most effective writing assignment? Why?
2.	Which is the writing assignment that I find most challenging? Why?
3.	How have I made use of the comments and feedback from my teacher and classmates?

4. What short-term and long-term learning goals can I set to improve my writing skills in the second term? What possible actions can I take to attain these goals?

Things I did not do well	Learning Goals	Proposed actions
	Short-term goal 1	e.g. to study relevant grammar notes
	Short-term goal 2	
	Long-term goal 1	
	Long-term goar 1	
	Long-term goal 2	

4. What short-term and long-term learning goals can I set to improve my writing skills in the second term? What possible actions can I take to attain these goals?

Things I did not do well	Learning Goals	Proposed actions
	• to improve the subject-verb agreement in my writing	to study relevant grammar notes
In my writing, I have problems using: correct subject-verb agreement; and correct tenses.	Short-term goal 2 • to create more interesting stories	to read more stories and try to learn the ways to create more interesting stories
 In my stories, I am weak in: creating interesting beginnings; writing interesting dialogues; and including a message or a theme. 	Long-term goal 1 • to get a higher mark in my writing assignments	to include good ideas and write grammatically correct sentences in my writing
	Long-term goal 2	

Worksheet III

Activity 2: Revision of Learning Goals and Proposed Actions (with feedback from the teacher) In this activity, I will read the feedback and suggestions from my teacher and revise my learning goals and proposed actions. Feedback /suggestions from my teacher

1. Finalised learning goals and proposed actions

Complete the parts on self-reflection and further action during the learning process.

Learning Goals	Proposed actions	Self-reflection*	Further Action
Short-term			
goal 1			
Short-term			
goal 2			

Complete the parts on self-reflection and further action by _____ (the proposed date in *Worksheet II*).

Sample B

Activity 2: Revision of Learning Goals and Proposed Actions (with feedback from the teacher)

In this activity, I will

 read the feedback and suggestions from my teacher and revise my learning goals and proposed actions.

Feedback /suggestions from my teacher

You can summarise your problems quite accurately. Well done!

Your short-term goal to improve subject-verb agreement is specific enough. Have you established the habit to proofread your work after you have finished writing? You can try proofreading your writing assignment to check subject-verb agreement.

Your long-term goal is too general. Your proposed action to include good ideas and grammatically correct sentences will be difficult to attain at this stage.

Instead of aiming to create more interesting stories all at once, you can first focus on creating more interesting beginnings. This can be a long-term goal as it takes more time to achieve.

You can find out how writers create interesting beginnings by reading more stories and focussing on the techniques writers use to begin their stories. For the time being, you can try beginning your stories with a mystery, a problem or a question to capture the attention of the reader.

2. Finalised learning goals and proposed actions

Complete the parts on self-reflection and further action during the learning process.

Learning Goals	Proposed actions	Self-reflection*	Further Action
Short-term goal 1 • to improve subject- verb agreement in my writing	 to study relevant grammar notes to proofread twice every writing assignment and check subject-verb agreement 	 I found that I need to pay attention to some special cases. For example, I should use the singular form of a verb after 'the number of people' and the plural form after 'a number of people'. I proofread my writing twice and could spot a few mistakes and correct them. This is helpful. 	• I should focus more on some 'tricky' nouns such as 'equipment' and 'furniture' that are always followed by the singular form of a verb.
Short-term goal 2			

Complete the parts on self-reflection and further action by _____ (the proposed date in *Worksheet II*).

Learning Goals	Proposed actions	Self-reflection*	Further Action
Long-term goal 1 • to create more interesting beginnings in my stories	 to read more stories and find out how writers create interesting beginnings to try new ways of beginning my stories (e.g. starting with a mystery, a problem or a question to capture the attention of a reader) 	 When I read, I have paid more attention to different ways of starting a story. My list of 'new ways to start a story' helps me think more creatively. I was able to get good comments on the beginnings of my stories, but I seem to be using the same techniques all the time. 	 I will continue to read more stories (two per week) to explore more different ways to begin my stories. When I read new stories, I can think of alternative beginnings for them. I will also practise writing stories on my own. Practice makes perfect.
Long-term goal 2			

Worksheet IV

Activity 4: Overall Self-evaluation

In this activity, I will

- evaluate the overall attainment of my learning goals and the effectiveness of the proposed actions in attaining the goals by the date proposed in Worksheet II;
- · reflect on the overall effectiveness of my plan to improve writing skills; and
- plan for the next stage.

1.	How well did I accomplish the short-term and long-term goals and the proposed actions I se for myself?		
2.	What problems did I encounter in the process and how did I overcome them?		
3.	List three ways I think I have developed or grown as a result of this plan for improving writing skills?		
4.	What am I still not sure about?		

5.	What am I going to work on or improve next?
6.	Response from my teacher:

An overview of the key considerations among assessment of, for and as learning

	Summative Assessment	Formative Assessment
	Assessment of Learning	Assessment for Learning Assessment as Learning
		Gradual increase of learner responsibility Teacher-centred student-centred
Purposes and objectives	 To assess learners' achievement against set learning goals and standards 	 To enable teachers to use information about learners' where they monitor their own progress, ask questions and practise learning strategies To involve learners in the learning process where they monitor their own progress, ask questions and practise learning strategies To enable learners to use self-evaluation and teachers' feedback to reflect on and
		consolidate their own learning and work towards the set personal learning goals
Use of assessment data	 For selection, placement, promotion and awarding qualifications 	 For providing information to facilitate teachers' instructional decisions personal learning goals For providing feedback and suggestions to help learners make improvement For informing learners of their strengths and weaknesses
Reference	External standards and expectations	· Set teaching objectives and · Personal goals and expectations
points	Performance of other candidates	expected learning outcomes
Modes	Pen and paper tests and examinationsPractical exams	Observations / assignments / self-evaluation formsSelf-access and self-directed learning tasks

References

Dann, R. (2002). *Promoting assessment as learning: improving the learning process*. London; New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Davies, A. (2011). *Leading the way to assessment for learning: a practical guide*. Bloomington, IN: Solution Tree Press.

Earl, Lorna M. (2003). Assessment as learning: using classroom assessment to maximize student learning. Calif.: Corwin Press.

Earl, Lorna M. (2006). *Rethinking Classroom Assessment with Purpose in Mind: Assessment for Learning, Assessment As learning, Assessment of Learning*. Manitoba: Government of Manitoba.

Pang, S. (2008). *The practice of assessment for learning and metagcognitive teaching in Hong Kong classrooms*. Hong Kong: Faculty of Education, Hong Kong Institute of Education Research.

Ministry of Education, Ontario, Canada http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/curriculum/secondary/english.html

The Literacy and Numeracy Secretariat (Ontario, Canada) http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/literacynumeracy/inspire/research/studentselfassessment.pdf